Minutes

Subject: Aircraft Noise Community Consultative Group ("ANCCG")

Location: Manukau Room, West Annex, Manukau Civic Centre

31-33 Manukau Station Road, Manukau

Date and time: 4 December 2018, 1:00pm – 3:00pm

Present David Shand, Independent Chair

Charlotte Day, Auckland Airport

Mike Turner, Airways NZ

Justin Tighe-Umbers, BARNZ

Helen Futter, Community Representative Mark Easson, Community Representative

Nicholas Lau, Auckland Council

Amanda Hopkins, Franklin Local Board

Malcolm Bell, Franklin Local Board Stella Cattle, Manurewa Local Board

Tafafuna'i Tasi Lauese, Māngere-Ōtāhuhu Local Board

Bill McEntee, Papakura Local Board David Holm, Puketāpapa Local Board

Troy Churton, Ōrākei Local Board

Kevin Kevany, Special Advisor, Ōrākei Local Board Steve Tollestrup, Waitākere Ranges Local Board

In Attendance: Laura McNeill, Marshall Day Acoustics

Matthew Dugmore, Auckland Airport

Emma Howie, Auckland Airport Justis Kamu, Auckland Airport

Jomaine Wareham, Minute-Secretary/Auckland Airport

Apologies Alf Filipaina, Auckland Council

Robert Laulala, Auckland Council

Tiumalu Peter Fa'afiu, Industry Representative Donna Lee, Ōtara-Papatoetoe Local Board



1. PUBLIC SESSION

1.1 Welcome and opening comments from the Chair

The meeting was declared open by the Chair, Mr David Shand at 1:00pm.

The Chair noted that this was his last meeting after three years in the position. . It was noted that a valedictory statement by him has been circulated electronically to the group but he did not propose to speak to it. He advised that his replacement has not yet been announced but they will be taking over from March 2019. The Chair noted that normal processes will continue for next year of circulating preferences for dates, day and time and Airport staff will do their best to accommodate these preferences.

A discussion then ensued on the venue of meetings in 2019. Kevin Kevany noted that the drop in attendance of local boards may be due to the current location and time of the meeting. The Chair noted that the decision on the meeting venues lies with the Committee and invited the group to share their views. Ms. Day commented clarified that an appropriate venue near the airport, such as a hotel, can provide better logistics in terms of technology, acoustics within the room and parking. After discussion and an informal vote Charlotte's proposal was agreed to.

It was suggested by Stella Cattle and agreed by the group that local boards and Auckland Council be requested advertise the ANCCG meeting dates and locations on their websites to better inform the public of ANCCG activity,

The Chair then noted that the meeting location for 2019 will be at a hotel close to the airport and Committee members will be asked to provide feedback on the preferred day, date and time.

Ms Day invited those members of the Group who may be interested to participate in an airside bus tour of the Airport prior to the next meeting. The meeting noted this opportunity with approval.

1.2 Apologies

The apologies were noted and accepted by the meeting. The Chair noted that seven local boards were represented at the s meeting but that four were not represented. Present: Franklin, Māngere-Ōtāhuhu, Manurewa, Ōrākei, Puketāpapa, Papakura and Waitakere Ranges. Absent: Albert-Eden, Howick, Maungakiekie-Tamaki, and Ōtara-Papatoetoe. (Whau does not exercise its right to have a representative.)



1.3 Minutes of meeting held on 4 September 2018

The minutes of the September meeting had been circulated and received by the Committee. A change was proposed to the minutes in relation to the complaints system and its visibility on the website - reference agenda item 1.10 3rd paragraph, the following line is proposed to be added: *This was agreed to and supported by the committee members*.

The Chair regretted he had not had the time to follow this up and therefore has assigned the task to Helen Futter to pursue on behalf of the committee. Ms Futter has accepted.

The minutes were then accepted as a true and accurate record.

1.4 Comments and Issues Raised by Members of the Public

The Chair invited David Hopkins, a member of the public, to speak. Mr Hopkins is a resident of Wattle Downs, located along the peninsula in South Auckland adjacent to Weymouth. He addressed the group. Mr Hopkins has had discussions with his local board's ANCCG member Stella Cattle who is aware of the rising number of aircraft noise complaints from residents in his area. He submitted a complaint on noise recorded at 4.33am one morning and accepts that the response process was satisfactory. He stated that at some times of the day he cannot talk to his partner outside due to the noise level. He also understands and appreciates the work currently being done by the wider industry and acknowledges Air NZ's part in noise reduction. His preference is that there are no night time flights over residential areas unless it is unavoidable such as in an emergency and that all flights attempt to fly over water or other non-residential areas.

The following points were noted: Ms Cattle confirmed that she has received an increased number of noise complaints from the Wattle Downs area, Mike Turner confirmed that, as the pathways have not changed the source of the noise will be one of the early morning freight planes, Justin Tighe-Umbers explained that aircraft technology and other agencies continue to work on noise mitigation, as this is a global problem. The Chair asked Ms Cattle if complaints have been registered so that staff can check for any trends/patterns and monitoring of these concerns. Ms Futter asked if there were noise monitors in the Wattle Downs, it was confirmed by the Chair that this monitor is new. Mr Kevany noted that complaints rise during the summer.

1.5 Matters arising from the previous minutes

The Chair invited the group to raise any particular matters for discussion.

David Holm raised the issue of helicopter noise, reference agenda item 1.5, requesting contact details. The Chair reiterated that helicopter noise is not within the ANCCG TOR and that it had been agreed at previous meetings that concerned parties should contact Airways NZ, who will do their best to provide information on the helicopter flights concerned.



1.6 Quarterly Aircraft Noise Report, August to October 2018

The Chair noted that this report had been distributed and received by the group in soft and hard copy format, provided by Marshall Day. It was noted that a supplementary excel sheet was also distributed which provided details of flights which had been specifically identified as the source of complaints in the period. This information included origin of the flight, the aircraft type, time of the complaint and whether the aircraft was landing or taking off. This was prepared by Ms Day of Auckland Airport at the request of the Chair.

Laura McNeill provided a summary of changes contained in the quarterly report and discussed points relevant to the trend in complaints. The following points were noted: Fig 6 on pg 8 supports the information in Fig 5 on p 7 which is the number of SMART approaches per week; pg 16 table 3 is a summary of noise complaints in the three-month period from Aug-Oct 2018; Fig 18 on pg 20 is a summary of noise complaints by origin or destination and although this is not new, there is additional information on complaints that were not matched to a specific flight eg. helicopters.

Ms McNeill referred to the relocation of monitors, specifically the Pakuranga monitor which has now been removed and is kept as a spare. Ms Futter commented that more monitors could be distributed and that she would like to discuss the locations of monitors. There was discussion on the reasons behind the current location of monitors. The main objective is to monitor areas deemed to have more or changing noise exposure and if there is no data/useful information on trends the monitors are then moved to other areas to ensure flexibility and the monitoring of trends in different areas. The Chair confirmed that local boards can submit a proposal to the Airport and request to have a particular monitor placed in a specific location. Ms Day will bring this to the next meeting.

The Chair referred the group to Fig22 on pg24 and to the additional handout provided by Ms Day which relates to specific aircrafts identified in noise complaints. This was not an extensive list of complaints, but allowed the group to look at trends in the patterns of complaints with a view to implementing additional procedures to mitigate noise. He stated that previously the Committee was aware that most complaints related to international landings at night particularly in relation to Runway 23L, but that this new schedule provided more detailed information. Whereas he had previously though most complaints related to late night Sydney arrivals the new report showed a different picture.

In particular early morning arrivals on Runway 5R from North America are a significant source of complaint as set out in Fig10 pg13., Mr Easson commented that the diagrams provide a good analysis of where noise complaints are generated, as does fig8 on pg11.

With reference to the information provided by Ms Day and the cause of complaints, the Chair raised the following points for discussion;

• early arrivals from the US coming across the city to turn onto runway 5R – this will be addressed by a new routing which is yet to be established by the industry groups, may



use a similar approach like 23L.

- ensuring the use of Night Stars this is being fully observed but could it not be extended to night arrivals from Sydney?
- aircraft freighters early morning from Sydney disturbing residents in Beachlands
- CAA Rule 93 this is on the agenda for discussion below, led by Mr Easson

The Chair requested that Ms Day provide a further summary of this information from a different time period for future meetings, so that it could be determined whether the information in the report reflected a general pattern.

Mr Easson commented on and queried the number of increased complaints related to aircraft flying at high speed over LOSGA, whether pilots can do this late at night and could request that speed restrictions be lifted. Mr Turner invited Mr Easson to discuss this with him offline.

In conclusion the Chair commented that while there is a large amount of monitoring of aircraft noise, the challenge is how that monitoring information is used and interpreted. The group was invited to contact Ms McNeill directly with any questions, queries or concerns.

1.7 Mark Easson - CAA Rules

Mr Easson raised the following points: He requested Auckland Airport to put in process a change to CAA Rule Part 93 which relates to the requirement that aircraft taking off from the north east are stipulated to climb to 3,000ft before turning left. Mr Easson would like this changed to 5,000ft after 10pm. He considered that such a request should come from the Airport as it is an Auckland airport specific procedure. However it was noted from the CAA presentation to the September meeting that a request for change to any CAA rules can be submitted by anyone.

The Chair noted that the request for change can by submitted the ANCCG, and this was generally supported by the group. However, he requested that the industry representatives (Airways, BARNZ and AIAL) provide a formal response to Mr Easson's proposal for consideration by the next ANCCG meeting.

1.8 SMART Approaches – Update on Yellow and New Orange approach

The Chair invited the industry representatives (Airport, ARNZ and Airways NZ) to provide an overview on the existing yellow and proposed new orange SMART approaches. They provided a recap on the Yellow U23 approach trials in 2015-16. Mr Turner from Airways provided details on the new Orange S23 trial flight path which will be trialed in March 2019 covering domestic flights from the south and south-east. The trial will have a mid-year review and public consultation on the findings will take place at the end of the one year trial period.



The PPT presentation will be circulated to ANCCG members and placed on the ANCCG

website.

1.9 **Aeropath Presentation – Auckland Airspace Design**

The Chair invited Matt Day and James Black from Aeropath to present to the group on the

procedures behind the design of flight paths. The key points from their presentation included that flight paths are developed taking account of safety, efficiency and

environmental considerations. The presentation included an explanation for why flight paths

are located where they are taking in to account these factors. In the case of Auckland, noise

was a consideration for the design of the airspace and current flight paths. The waypoint

LOSGA is the natural joining point for aircraft arriving from the north and west to allow for

the safe and efficient use of airspace in conjunction with considerations for noise and

Auckland's unique airspace – such as military operating areas near to the CBD.

The Chair thanked Aeropath for their attendance and presentation. The PPT will be

distributed to ANCCG members and placed on the ANCCG website.

1.10 **Independent Chair Valedictory Comments**

Please refer to the softcopy PPT distributed by the Chair prior to the meeting.

1.11 Other Business

Emma Howie advised second runway decision is being publicly notified by Council today.

This is the Auckland Council's recommendation on Auckland Airport's application. The

Airport have 30 days to make their final decision on Council's recommendation. Updates will

be provided in due course.

On behalf of the ANCCG, Mr Holm thanked and acknowledged Mr Shand's chairmanship of

the ANCCG. He believed that there have been marked improvements on managing noise

complaints, improving the scope of noise monitoring information and working collaboratively

between the industry and the local boards.

The Chair thanked the group, acknowledging that the industry parties have done a

significant amount of work to improve noise reporting and being willing to modify some flight

paths to reduce. noise. However he believed that more remains to be done. He also noted

the need for greater involvement by local boards as a whole.

Meeting closed: 3:20pm

Next meeting: 2019 dates and venues yet to be confirmed

Page 6