

Minutes

Subject:	Meeting of the Aircraft Noise Community Consultative Group	
Location:	Pohutukawa Room – Quad 5, Leonard Isitt Drive / via Microsoft Teams Meeting	
Date:	14 December 2020	Time: 1:00pm – 3.00pm
Members Present	In Person: Kristina Cooper, Auckland Airport Helen Twose, Auckland Airport (alternate) Justin Tighe-Umbers, BARNZ Malcolm Bell, Franklin Local Board (from 1.10pm) Tauanu’u Nick Bakulich, Māngere-Ōtāhuhu Local Board	Via Teams: Catherine Harland, Independent Chair Councillor Alf Filipaina, Auckland Council Ellar Kumar, Puketāpapa Local Board Helen Futter, Community Representative Jan Robinson, Papakura Local Board (departed 2.30pm) Kevin Kevany, Ōrākei Local Board (alternate) Mark Allen, Waitākere Ranges Local Board (from 1.30pm) Mark Easson, Community Representative Sophia Healey, Airways NZ Troy Churton, Ōrākei Local Board (departed 2.15pm) Warren Piper, Whau Local Board
In Attendance	In Person: Hana Lee, Auckland Airport Shaun Sie, Auckland Airport Gillian Urquhart, Auckland Airport	Via Teams: James Evans, Airways NZ Laura McNeill, Marshall Day Acoustics Pranaya Thaker, Marshall Day Acoustics Matthew Dugmore, Auckland Airport David Wong, Auckland Council
Members of the Public	Nil	
Apologies	Graeme Easte, Albert-Eden Local Board Ashraf Choudhary, Ōtara-Papatoetoe Local Board Libby Middlebrook, Auckland Airport	

1. Welcome, apologies and attendance

The meeting was declared open by the Independent Chair, at 1:04 pm. The apologies were noted and accepted.

2. Public Forum

The Chair noted that no request had been received from any member of the public to speak or observe the meeting.

3. NZ Aviation Coalition Co-Chair Update

Mr Justin Tighe-Umbers provided a brief update on the aviation sector:

- The sector is experiencing a relatively strong performing domestic network, albeit at approximately 20% of pre-Covid levels at the time of this meeting. The second lockdown in Auckland region reduced flight movements by 75% during alert level 3. During alert level 2, when the in-flight social distancing rule was removed, that contributed to recovery. In alert level 1, the sector is now sitting at 80% of the pre-Covid level.
- International flight movements remain down by 90%. The number of international visitors is reduced by 98% (13,000 returnees per month vs 600,000 arriving passengers in pre-Covid times).
- Overall, a 45 – 50% reduction in air movements.
- A lot of work is happening at airports to provide for traveller separation.
- On Saturday 12 December 2020, the Government announced it is expecting to open a safe travel zone to the Cook Islands in Feb/March 2021.
- Aviation sector is hopeful of an announcement that a safe travel zone will be opened with a trans-Tasman-bubble in the 1st quarter of 2021.

4. Minutes of meeting held on 14 September 2020

The Chair moved and the ANCCG resolved that the minutes of the meeting held on 14 September 2020 be confirmed as true and correct.

5. Matters arising from the previous minutes

A hardcopy of Matters Arising in a table format was received by the Group for discussion. Updates were provided on items not considered elsewhere in the agenda:

5.1. Point 1: Industry and mana whenua representatives – The Position Description of the Industry Representative was drafted and circulated to the ANCCG on 18 November. No feedback comments had been received from group since then. Ms Kristina Cooper verbally advised that Ms Charlotte Day had talked to the previous holder of the role and reflected his input in the draft Job Description. Members indicated comfort with the draft.

In terms of the process for identifying a potential representative, the Ms Cooper referred to an earlier memo outlining potential organisations that could be approached. The Chair indicated that the Council's governance group may have ideas. Councillor Alf Filipaina indicated he would pass it on to the Council for suggestions.

Plans for a Mana Whenua position description to be discussed next year.

Action: The Chair to send the Position Description for the Industry Representative to Councillor Alf Filipaina who will pass on to the Council Governance Group.

5.2. *Point 2: Northern STAR serving 05 to be developed* –The cost of previous STAR developments had been requested by the ANCCG members in previous meetings.

Mr James Evans has spoken to Aeropath design team and they have estimated \$10,000 allowing for a 5-7 day design production. Mr Evans advised the development would require industry approval, validation by Airways and flight simulations by Air New Zealand.

Mr Kevin Kevany and Mr Troy Churton suggested each Local Board contribute funding towards the project. Ms Ella Kumar stated, confirmed by Mr Malcolm Bell, that consideration of grant funding will not be available until the next financial year, as the current financial year funding has been already allocated.

Mr Tighe-Umbers suggested this matter be revisited at the next meeting once the flight movements increase and industry's resources (people) are replenished.

Mr Mark Easson said this issue re a new Northern STAR is related to flights from the US arriving on Runway 05R, not flights from Australia. Mr Easson said there is a separate issue also being raised by Mr Kevany of flights from Australia which are supposed to use the existing Northern STARs to avoid overflights in the city, but which are not currently always being followed.

The Chair acknowledged there are two different issues here and understood the reduced resources in industry. The Chair suggested Mr Evans provide an indicative outline of the stages (and time for each stage) for the development of a new STAR, and also explain the background in relation to SYD/MEL flights (use of tracks and mileage). This information should be circulated in early February.

Action: Airways to provide a presentation of the indicative process for the new Northern STAR development and to explain the backgrounds of SYD/MEL night flights, with material circulated in February and presented at the next ANCCG meeting in March 2021.

6. Correspondence with the CAA regarding aircraft speed below 10,000ft and brake usage

Mr Easson stated another letter was sent to the CAA. The CAA responded saying it has raised the issue with Airways and have requested data from Airways to ascertain the scope of the issue, which they are waiting on Airways to provide. Mr Easson expressed frustration and said there has not been any progress.

Mr Evans confirmed Airways have received a request from CAA for data recently, however, the issue is complicated as Airways data records 'ground speed' as opposed to 'indicated air speed' – which means even a flight flying at 250 knots in airspeed will show excessive ground speed.

Mr Evans emphasised that the speed restriction of 250 knots below 10,000 feet is not a rule for a Class C Airspace, and the speed restriction is purely a sequencing tool for ATC, rather than a noise control measure.

Mr Easson said he understands this rule is not for noise control but considers that noise levels increase if the speed restriction is waived. Mr Easson said he has been requesting Airways to reinforce the speed restriction rules at night-time through these forums.

Mr Evans said the most aircraft get the speed restriction waived during daytime, however Airways have previously instructed ATC not to waive the speed restriction at night-time unless it is an operational requirement.

Ms Cooper suggested if Airways could provide a copy of the advisory communications so it can be circulated to the ANCCG that would be beneficial for members. Mr Evans said he will check with the Airways Policy & Legal Team and report back due to a sensitive data releasing policy.

Action: Airways to check with its Policy & Legal Team and report back on whether it is able to provide a copy of (or an extract from) the speed restriction advisory to its staff.

7. Summary of data from the noise monitor previously installed at Ridings Road

Ms Cooper advised that as agreed at the last ANCCG Marshall Day was requested to review the data from the noise monitor previously installed on Ridings Road between April 2016 and December 2017. She summarised the following:

- In Marshall Day's view, the location of the monitor was appropriate and was not affected by Mt Hobson
- It captured 98% of overflights and gathered good data
- The average noise level was 38 dB L_{dn} with less than 1 noise event at 70 dB L_{Amax} per day
- At the time of relocation, the ANCCG was consulted and agreed with moving the noise monitor from Ridings Road to Wattle Downs which experiences a high degree of aircraft noise
- The report concluded that no additional information would be gathered by installing a noise monitor back in Remuera, as flight paths are still similar today and there are two existing noise monitors close by.

Mr Churton said the Ōrākei Local Board has resolved a formal request for the noise monitor to be re-established back in the general Remuera zone, in a better location. Mr Churton is asking the ANCCG to support the request from Ōrākei Local Board.

Ms Helen Futter said she does not support this request at all, as there are enormous differences in noise levels between Wattle Downs and Remuera. Ms Futter believes the data previously collected by the scientific model was good and sufficient. The monitor should remain in Wattle Downs and no more money should be spent on installing an additional monitor in Remuera. Ms Futter said she did not believe the Ōrākei Board understood the scientific method involved in extrapolation of noise data from noise monitors and perhaps a scientific communicator (like those who have been used to great effect during the Covid-19 pandemic) needed to come and explain the process to the board. The whole boundary between MANA and ANNA is determined using extrapolation of data from noise monitors. If there was to be any relocation of noise monitors or placement of new noise monitors it should be along the boundary line of the ANNA and MANA. Under the designation for the 2nd runway that is where at least one new monitor was going to be placed. This boundary has a significant effect on community members as it determines whether or not people are eligible for a 75% subsidised noise mitigation package.

Mr Churton advised that he still believes the previous measurement is known to be flawed due to its suboptimal location. Ms Laura McNeill said the Memo on Ridings Road addressed all aspects thoroughly, and thus no further comment can be made.

Mr Kevany said a large portion of complaints are from the central suburbs. Mr Pranaya Thaker advised that 21 of 38 complaints were from a single complainant in Ōrākei area, which consists 58% of entire complaints in last quarter. Ms Futter said there is no relation between the number of complaints and the noise level. Ms Futter also said the locations of noise monitor should be considered carefully. Ms Futter acknowledged it is unrealistic to install monitors everywhere. Councilor Filipaina agreed with Ms Futter's comments.

Ms Jan Robinson said people have different level of noise tolerance. Ms Robinson who resides underneath the extended runway centerline in Manukau and her neighbours never experienced issues with aircraft noise despite many planes flying overhead.

Mr Churton advised that he did not request to move the monitor in Wattle Downs to Remuera, but instead wanted one of the central Auckland monitors in Mt Eden or Mt Wellington to be relocated to Remuera temporarily.

Ms Cooper enquired of Marshall Day whether moving monitors in Mt Eden and Mt Wellington to Remuera would give any new information. Ms McNeill advised it depends on what data we are intending to collect, but Mt Eden and Mt Wellington have more overflights compared to Remuera.

Ms Cooper stated that Auckland Airport would not recommend relocating any of the noise monitors in South Auckland, considering the predominance of domestic air movement.

The Chair sought an indication from all ANCCG members as to whether there was any support for a temporary relocation of a monitor to a Remuera location. No support was evident.

Mr Churton said he will review the minutes and the Ōrākei Local Board may pursue other avenues.

8. Annual Report from Auckland Airport Noise Community Trust

The Chair welcomed Gillian Urquhart from the Auckland Airport Noise Community Trust. Ms Urquhart is one of two nominees to the Trust for Auckland Airport. The ANCCG also has a representative on the Trust, Tauanu'u Nick Bakulich.

Ms Urquhart introduced the work of the Community Trust and summarised the following:

- The Trust was set up in 2003, fully funded by Auckland Airport, to ensure positive effects and offset adverse effects from aircraft operations
- The Trust's vision is to make the airport's neighbourhood a great place to live, work, play and learn
- The Trust's mission is to provide grants for the mitigation in homes affected by aircraft noise, along with supporting and developing grassroots community groups around the airport
- Over \$5 million has been given to the community since 2003
- Prior to 2018, the focus of the grants was on literacy and learning within the community. In 2018, the Trust decided to widen its focus to cover a greater range of people and activities while remaining within the terms of the Trust Deed and the number of applications in 2019 more than doubled
- In 2019, a rapid response grant programme was also launched enabling quick grants of up to \$2,500 to be made
- Ms Urquhart extended the invitation for ANCCG members to attend the Trust's AGM which is held every October
- For more information, please visit <https://www.aucklandairportcommunitytrust.org.nz/>

The Chair enquired how many grants were received in the MANA. Ms Urquhart answered 34 people received the grant last year and 37 in the year before.

The Chair and the Group thanked Ms Urquhart for her presentation.

9. Quarterly Aircraft Noise Report

Mr Thaker of Marshall Day Acoustics presented the Quarterly Aircraft Noise Report and summarised the following points:

- The average daily aircraft movements were half of the same quarter in last year
- The number of complaints between Aug – Oct 2020 decreased when compared to the same period last year, however it increased from the previous quarter

- The total number of complaints was 36, 21 of them generated by a single individual in Remuera
- There was a significant increase in the monthly L_{dn} data from the Clevedon monitor. This is due to an earlier failure in calibration (see page 34).

The Chair reminded members that the finalised version of Annual Noise Management Report has been circulated. Ms Futter noted there is a typo in 8th paragraph of the Annual Noise Management Report Executive Summary regarding engine testing, with the word “not” being missed out.

Action: Marshall Day to correct the executive summary of the Annual Noise Management Report

10. Quarterly Noise Mitigation Programme Report

A copy of the Quarterly Noise Mitigation Programme Report and the Noise Mitigation Brochure had been circulated to the Group prior to the meeting. Mr Dugmore summarised the following:

- A COVID-19 Work Plan has been developed for each of the four alert levels:
 - Under alert level 1, full programme will be implemented following level 1 guidelines.
 - Under alert levels 2 & 3, Auckland Airport will continue to respond to enquiries, registration of covenants will continue however no scoping or installation will take in place in occupied properties.
 - Under alert level 4, the programme will put on hold
- The noise contour has significantly retracted by approximately by 6dBA L_{dn} compared to the 2020 AANC. There are no eligible properties for noise mitigation offers within the 2020 AANC. Therefore, two options for the 2021 Noise Mitigation Offer were considered:
 - Offering Noise Mitigation to properties which are within the future HANA contours, which would be approximately 200 properties
 - Not making any offers, as there are no eligible properties within the 2020 HANA contours.
- Both options are compliant with Designation 1100. Auckland Airport have considered both options in terms of their opportunities and risks and have decided to proceed with Option 1, offering the package to all properties in the future HANA in line with being a good neighbour to surrounding residents. These offers will be made in March 2021.
- This year provides an opportunity to align the timing of the noise mitigation offers with the financial year, which will help with planning and budgeting. To achieve this, an additional AANC will be prepared and published in May 2021, and if required, additional offers will be made in July 2021. The Airport will undertake programme reporting at the start and middle of the financial year.
- Auckland Airport has committed to raise awareness of the Noise Mitigation Programme using various communication methods such as a physical letter to tenants, notice boards in schools and churches, radio and social media. Monitoring will occur to ascertain the most effective means of communication.
- In this last quarter between August and October 2020, 18 pre-inspections were undertaken, 10 offer letters have been sent since November, 9 properties are waiting for covenant registration and 7 installations have been completed.
- Collateral will be translated in the next few months in Te Reo, Hindi, Mandarin, Samoan and Tongan.

Mr Futter commented there had been some excellent changes to the programme and she had just noticed one small omission on the back of the Noise Mitigation brochure where there did not appear to be any Te Reo. Mr Dugmore advised that this is included in the work plan.

Mr Bakulich and the Chair acknowledged the good initiative by Auckland Airport to extend the offer beyond the legal requirements and the reflection of the good neighbour principle.

11. Work Plan Review

The Chair advised the 18-month member term review by the elected local board members is planned for the March 2021 meeting.

The Chair advised, that in consultation with Ms Cooper, the physical venue for the ANCCG meeting may remain as Auckland Airport in 2021 due to other facilities still being used as quarantine facilities. The meeting will be available both in person and via Teams online.

12. Other business

This is the last meeting for Ms McNeill as she is relocating and will be working from Marshall Day's Christchurch office. The Chair and group members thanked Ms McNeil for her valued contribution to the ANCCG over recent years.

Meeting closed: 3:01pm

Next meeting: Monday 8 March 2021 1:00pm – 3:00pm
Venue to be confirmed closer to the date