

Minutes

- Subject:** Aircraft Noise Community Consultative Group (“**ANCCG**”)
- Location:** Pavillion Room III, Sudima Hotel, 18 Airpark Drive, Auckland Airport
- Date:** 4 March 2019 **Time:** 1:00pm – 3.06pm
- Present:** Catherine Harland, Independent Chair
Nick Bakulich, Māngere-Ōtāhuhu Local Board
Malcolm Bell, Franklin Local Board
Troy Churton, Ōrākei Local Board
Charlotte Day, Auckland Airport
Mark Easson, Community Representative
Graeme Easte, Albert-Eden Local Board
James Evans, Airways NZ
Peter Fa’afiu, Industry Representative
Helen Futter, Community Representative
David Holm, Puketāpapa Local Board
Emma Howie, Auckland Airport
Kevin Kevany, Special Advisor, Ōrākei Local Board
Robert Laulala, Auckland Council
Donna Lee, Ōtara-Papatoetoe Local Board
Justin Tighe-Umbers, BARNZ
Steve Tollestrup, Waitākere Ranges Local Board
Mike Turner, Airways NZ
- In Attendance:** Laura McNeill, Marshall Day Acoustics
Jomaine Wareham, Minute-Secretary/Auckland Airport
Matthew Dugmore, Auckland Airport
- Members of the public:** Kylie Goodwin, Observer
Peter Ryan, Wattle Downs resident
Trevor Weaver, resident
- Apologies:** Stella Cattle, Manurewa Local Board
Dr Ashraf Choudhary, Ōtara-Papatoetoe Local Board
Councillor Alf Filipaina, Auckland Council
Amanda Hopkins, Franklin Local Board
Hugh Pearce, BARNZ
Kellie Roland, Auckland Airport

1. PUBLIC SESSION

1.1 Welcome and apologies

The meeting was declared open by the Independent Chair, Catherine Harland at 1:05pm. The apologies were noted and accepted by the meeting.

1.2 Incoming Chair Introduction

The newly appointed ANCCG Chair had sent an email introduction and details of her background to the members of the committee and thanked those who had responded.

The committee were invited to introduce themselves and describe what they would like to achieve in 2019. Key points noted were: less noise over residential areas, using evidence from data gathered to pinpoint areas of concern (e.g. night flights, low-flying, routes) and means to help mitigate aircraft noise, working with appropriate airport staff to improve the complaints process via the website, learning more about the noise mitigation package and the measured outcomes that result from an installation, continuing to build on the positive dialogue had to date, finding the balance between the critical role of the airport and the aircraft noise effects. Mark Eason indicated he would highlight some further points under Item 1.10.

The round-table introduction also included acknowledgement of three members of the public in attendance, noting that one had asked to attend as an observer.

1.3 Public Forum

The Chair invited members of the public to present to the ANCCG.

- (a) Mr Trevor Weaver addressed the Group to express his concerns about aircraft noise, referring to a contour map provided by Ms Emma Howie. Mr Weaver advised that he had met with Emma Howie and Chris Day from Marshall Day during mid-2018 and for a period of 2.5 months Marshall Day had monitored the noise at his property on Awhitu Peninsula which revealed noise levels did not exceed 60dB. He commented on the Singapore A380 flights going over his bach and requested details of December to February Casper flight plans to show approaches and departures over his bach. He believes the current model used by Marshall Day to generate the noise contours is defective and inaccurate and feels the complaints process with the airport has been unsatisfactory providing dates of complaints submitted without a response. Mr Weaver believes the airport has no control over planes as they do not seem to adhere to plans/flight paths and that is a significant concern in relation to controls that will apply in the future for the second runway. He is extremely frustrated and noted that, in his opinion, there has been no action taken by Auckland Airport in response to his complaints. He expressed a willingness to use a drone or other means to cause disruption to aircraft taking off and landing at Auckland Airport.

Note: At the conclusion of the ANCCG meeting Charlotte Day (Auckland Airport), James Evans (Airways NZ) and Justin Tighe-Umbers (BARNZ) met with Mr Weaver and Malcolm Bell (Franklin Local Board).

- (b) Mr Peter Ryan, resident of Wattle Downs addressed the Group to express his concerns. The following points were noted: as a long-time resident he has noticed flight noise increase in the area (where the red flight path flies) and there is increased aircraft noise in the south Auckland area generally compared to that in more affluent communities in the north or east. Mr Ryan has prepared background information about health risks and is circulating that material in the local area with a request for local residents to sign an online petition calling for a range of actions. At this stage 171 signatures had been received. Mr Ryan tabled the document and it is attached to these minutes.

On behalf of the ANCCG, the Chair thanked Mr Weaver and Mr Ryan for attending and indicated that the information provided will be considered at the next meeting.

1.4 Minutes of meeting held on 4 December 2018

Graeme Easte requested the minutes be amended to note his apologies for the December meeting.

The minutes, with the above amendment, were then accepted as a true and accurate record.

Nick Bakulich prompted the Chair to invite ANCCG members to ask any questions they may have once a member of the public has presented to the Group. An invitation was extended at that point with no questions arising.

1.5 Matters arising from the previous minutes

The Chair distributed a hardcopy of Matters Arising in a table format and was received by the Group for discussion. Updates were provided on items not yet complete:

- *Point 4: Chair to pursue the issue of changes to the website to increase the visibility of how to access the complaints system.* Helen Futter advised she had commenced working on this and invited the Group to give feedback. Charlotte Day and Emma Howie will provide direction for Helen and will discuss details offline. Kevin Kevany commented and requested the creation of a gmail account for complaints, in place of searching the website. Troy Churton suggested there needed to be an easier way to log a complaint with systems designed to be customer centric and readily accessible. Concern was expressed about the delay of 25 minutes using Casper whereas other systems, such as FlightRadar24, has live information or shorter delays. Ms Day advised that the complaint process had been discussed previously and having a phone number manned 24/7 along with a structured online form capturing information to assist in identifying aircraft, was seen to be more effective than a generic 'noise complaint' email address. There is no plan to go back to a separate 'noise complaint' email address. James Evans confirmed flight radar is a subscription system. The Chair noted website improvements will remain on the agenda for future updates.

- *Point 6: Relocation of monitors to be brought to next meeting.* Ms Day advised she is working on a wider strategy to determine the parameters around the placement of noise monitors. Local boards have been invited to send their feedback and Franklin Board has responded with some suggestions. Member comments related to: the process of moving and removing monitors; there are now seven temporary monitors as one in Pakuranga had been removed at the owners request in November 2018; a suggestion to purchase additional monitors; and queries relating to the use of monitoring equipment in anticipation of the second runway. Malcolm Bell and Troy Churton requested further discussion on moving monitors be held at the June meeting. Details of the new S23 flight path trial were discussed noting it commences on 31 March 2019.
- *Point 7: Further summary information from a different time period relating to the new schedule handed out in December to be provided for future meetings.* Ms Day and David Shand had discussed the information shared on details of the origins of flights which formed the basis of complaints. It was suggested by Mark Easson that it would be useful to provide a similar summary for the next meeting. Ms Day and Laura McNeill to gather information for the month of the highest complaints and present at the next meeting.
- *Point 8: Chair request for industry representatives to provide a formal response to Mr Easson's proposal to change CAA Rule Part 93 for aircraft to climb to 5,000ft after 10pm before turning.* Ms Day suggested that Mr Easson could submit this on behalf of the ANCCG committee. Ms McNeill to check how often in the previous year that action is being done voluntarily, prior to a submission being made.

1.6 Quarterly Aircraft Noise Report November 2018 to January 2019

The Chair noted that the Marshall Day report had been distributed and received by the Group in soft and hard copy format.

Ms McNeill provided a summary of changes contained in the quarterly report and discussed relevant points regarding the trend in complaints. The key points noted were: Figure 1 on page 3 showed there was an increase of operations over the summer period which correlates to when demand is high. Table 3 on page 16 showed there were 194 complaints received over a three month period which is up slightly due to increased movements over the summer period and a repeat complainant.

The Chair and Ms McNeill invited the Group to give feedback for discussion and the following was noted. David Holm raised questions around his request for a table in the report showing noise complaints by destination. Ms McNeill referred Mr Holm to Figure 18 on page 20 which shows the number of specific aircraft complaints by destination over the past 12 months.

Kevin Kevany asked where people can forward complaints relating to flights going to/arriving from Great Barrier Island. Ms McNeill confirmed these can be submitted under the normal complaints process via Casper. You can click on the aircraft followed by the submit complaint icon and it takes you to a fillable form where the aircraft details are pre-entered. Otherwise you can telephone.

With reference to Figure 12 on page 17 Steve Tollestrup questioned why complaints correlate to aircraft movements around Auckland Airport and not around Whenuapai. Ms McNeill advised that the map relates to the residential area where complaints are received from. Figure 23 on page 25 shows the flight paths associated with specific complaints. It was suggested that Local Board ANCCG members should be cc'd into emails when complaints are being responded to. Ms McNeill understood that was happening but will investigate to ensure the process currently followed in that regard is working.

The Chair raised a number of questions. In respect of an analysis of complaints showing weekday vs weekend - Ms McNeill confirmed the data for this was gathered previously but not used. Ms McNeill is to obtain the information for the Chair. With reference to Figure 12 on page 17 Ms McNeill advised that a 'new' complainant is defined as a person who has complained for the very first time i.e. never registered a complaint before. Referring to Figure 34 on page 40 in respect of the increasing noise trends for engine testing in the last quarter, Ms McNeill confirmed that it is a net increase but levels remain well below the limit. In respect to general future forecast growth in aircraft movements, Ms McNeill confirmed the contours are calculated and forecasted and the Annual Report includes forecast numbers, e.g. for 5 years of flight growth. Emma Howie advised the noise contours are projected to the year 2044. The Chair would discuss further queries offline with Ms McNeill.

With reference to Figure 10 on page 13, Graeme Easte commented that a large number of flights turning right are reading over 70 decibels and asked what can be done to mitigate this. James Evans confirmed the aircraft are on a prescribed flight path and tracked. Mr Weaver interjected at this point and spoke further about his concerns.

1.7 Update on the Notice of Requirement for the Northern Runway, Noise Mitigation Programme and Airport Community Trust

Emma Howie addressed the Group and presented a summary via powerpoint presentation with a hardcopy distributed. The hearings for the Notice of Requirement were held in August and September 2018 and Auckland Council recommendation made in December 2018. Auckland Airport's decision was publicly notified on 14 February 2019 with appeals to the Environment Court closing on 7 March. Ms Howie also provided a summary of the Noise Mitigation Programme and details of the offers that will be made in April 2019. As is required, six monthly reporting of noise levels will also be submitted to Auckland Council. This generated a brief discussion on double-glazing which is not included in the package. Ms McNeill provided a summary on different types of double-glazed windows including thermal, acoustic (a lot more expensive) and Magnetite, a retrofit option which attaches to existing windows which Helen Futter made reference to.

Ms Howie also gave an overview of the implementation of the 30-year plan for Auckland Airport and how the Airport supports New Zealand.

If ANCCG members have any further questions they were invited to contact Ms Howie or Matthew Dugmore directly.

1.8 Noise 101

As this item was primarily for the newly appointed Chair's benefit, in the interests of time, it would be done offline.

1.9 Other Business

The Chair advised the ANCCG has the role of appointing a member to the Auckland Airport Community Trust. It was confirmed that Tasi Lauese has stepped down from this position and the Chair asked for any expressions of interest. David Holm nominated Nick Bakulich who indicated his acceptance. No further nominations arose and the ANCCG unanimously agreed the appointment of Mr Bakulich.

The Chair reminded the Group of the Orange trial which commences on the 31st March. It was noted that industry representatives have previously presented on this approach to the ANCCG and directly to the Franklin Local Board.

The Chair invited Mark Easson to speak to matters he would like the ANCCG to progress. Mr Easson commented that the Group had become more proactive compared to previous years and he would like to see that continue by building upon the positive outcomes to date e.g. Stillwater arrival for night flights from northwest and improved routing from the south. He would like to see: (1) runway 05R takeoffs always climbing to 5,000ft before turning west or north (2) early flights from the U.S. and points east landing on 05R to track north of the central suburbs, as in the Stillwater STAR reversed (3) takeoffs on runway 23L for the NE (often late at night) climbing to 5,000ft or flying modified routes to avoid the isthmus (4) better enforcement of procedures especially the 250 knots below 10,000ft rule - requests for high speed below 10,000ft should always be declined (5) re-route the very noisy early morning cargo operation from Sydney/Melbourne using old 747. He credited David Shand for assisting the Group to not only monitor noise activity but to seek out changes.

Mr Easte suggested production of rules or a guide for pilots to be a 'good neighbour with good behaviour' or 'flying with care throughout Auckland skies'. It could include, for example, voluntarily limiting aircraft braking at certain times, which has been previously discussed. Mr Easson explained the requirements for aircraft to brake given a range of factors and constraints would be impractical.

Mr Kevany commented on legislative changes and would like information or direction on how to more rapidly action change requests that accommodate new approaches. Mr Bakulich commented that he believed someone from Auckland Council would need to progress things.

The Chair invited ANCCG members to provide feedback on how future ANCCG meetings are run and to send her any further details about what they would like to achieve in 2019. Members made comments including: stick to the agenda, ensure ANCCG is proactive and keep the table/chart that notes any outstanding actions and matters arising.

Meeting closed: 15:06hrs

Next meeting: Monday 10 June 2019, 1:00pm – 3:00pm
Pavillion Room III, Sudima Hotel, 18 Airpark Drive, Auckland Airport